Basics of Security Protocols

- Work from the assumption (usually) that your encryption is sufficiently strong
- Given that, how do you design a message exchange to achieve a given result securely?
- Not nearly as easy as you probably think

Types of Security Protocols

- Arbitrated protocols
  - Involving a trusted third party
- Adjudicated protocols
  - Trusted third party, after the fact
- Self-enforcing protocols
  - No trusted third party

Participants in Security Protocols

- Alice
- Bob
- Carol
- David
And the Bad Guys

And sometimes Alice or Bob might cheat
Eve
Who only listens passively
Mallory
Who is actively malicious

Trusted Arbitrator

Trent
A disinterested third party trusted by all legitimate participants
Arbitrators often simplify protocols, but add overhead

Key Exchange Protocols

• Often we want a different encryption key for each communication session
• How do we get those keys to the participants?
  – Securely
  – Quickly
  – Even if they’ve never communicated before

Key Exchange With Symmetric Encryption and a Arbitrator

• Alice and Bob want to talk securely with a new key
• They both trust Trent
  – Assume Alice & Bob each share a key with Trent
• How do Alice and Bob get a shared key?

Step One

Alice

Bob

Trent

Alice Requests Session Key for Bob

K_A

K_B

K_A

K_B

Step Two

Alice

Bob

Trent

K_A

K_B

E_{K_A}(K_S), E_{K_B}(K_S)

Who knows what at this point?
Step Three

\[
\begin{align*}
K_A & \\
E_{K_A}(K_S) & \\
E_{K_B}(K_S) & \\
K_S & \\
K_B & \\
Bob & \\
Who \ knows \ what \ at \ this \ point? & \\
K_A & \\
Trent & \\
K_S & \\
K_B & \\
\end{align*}
\]

What Has the Protocol Achieved?

- Alice and Bob both have a new session key
- The session key was transmitted using keys known only to Alice and Bob
- Both Alice and Bob know that Trent participated
- But there are vulnerabilities

Problems With the Protocol

- What if the initial request was grabbed by Mallory?
- Could he do something bad that ends up causing us problems?
- Yes!

The Man-in-the-Middle Attack

- A class of attacks where an active attacker interposes himself secretly in a protocol
- Allowing alteration of the effects of the protocol
- Without necessarily attacking the encryption

Applying the Man-in-the-Middle Attack

- More precisely, what do they think they know?

Trent Does His Job

- E_{K_A}(K_S), E_{K_M}(K_S)
Alice Gets Ready to Talk to Bob

Really Getting in the Middle

Mallory Plays Man-in-the-Middle

Defeating the Man In the Middle

Applying the First Fix

And There’s Another Problem
Step One

Alice

Requests Session Key for Bob

Bob

Step Two

Alice

Requests Session Key for Bob

Mallory

Step Three

Alice

Requests Session Key for Bob

Mallory

What can Mallory do with his saved messages?

What Will Happen Next?

What’s so bad about that?

Key Exchange With Public Key Cryptography

- With no trusted arbitrator
- Alice sends Bob her public key
- Bob sends Alice his public key
- Alice generates a session key and sends it to Bob encrypted with his public key, signed with her private key
- Bob decrypts Alice’s message with his private key
- Encrypt session with shared session key
### Basic Key Exchange Using PK

- Alice’s PK is $K_{EA}$
- Bob’s PK is $K_{DB}$
- Alice’s PK is $K_{DA}$
- Bob’s PK is $K_{EB}$

Bob verifies the message came from Alice
Bob extracts the key from the message

---

### Man-in-the-Middle With Public Keys

- Alice’s PK is $K_{DA}$
- Bob’s PK is $K_{EB}$
- Alice’s PK is $K_{EM}$
- Bob’s PK is $K_{DM}$

Now Mallory can pose as Alice to Bob

---

### And Bob Sends His Public Key

- Bob’s PK is $K_{DB}$
- Bob’s PK is $K_{DM}$

Now Mallory can pose as Bob to Alice

---

### Alice Chooses a Session Key

- Bob and Alice are sharing a session key
- Bob and Alice are also sharing it with Mallory

---

### Defeating This Man-in-the-Middle Attack

- Use Rivest and Shamir’s interlock protocol
- Doesn’t require any authorities
- Essentially, send stuff in pieces of an encrypted whole
- The man in the middle has little chance of correctly dealing with pieces

---

### Using the Interlock Protocol

- Alice sends Bob her public key
- Bob sends Alice his public key
- Alice encrypts the message in Bob’s public key and sends half of it to Bob
- Bob encrypts his message in Alice’s public key and sends half of it to Alice
- Alice sends her other half to Bob
Continuing the Interlock Protocol

• Bob puts Alice’s two halves together and decrypts
• Bob sends the other half of his encrypted message to Alice
• Alice puts Bob’s halves together and decrypts

Why Does This Protocol Help?

• Because the man in the middle must provide half of an encrypted message before he gets all of it
• Consider one part of the attack -
  – Mallory wants to translate the message in Alice’s public key into Mallory’s public key

What Does Mallory Do?

• Mallory has deceptively sent out her public key to Bob and Alice
  – Claiming it’s theirs
  – And Mallory knows their public keys
• Alice send Mallory half of an encrypted message
• Now Mallory must send Bob half an encrypted message

Mallory’s Situation

Mallory’s Problem

• Mallory can’t yet decrypt Alice’s message
  – Since he only has half of it
• Mallory must provide Bob two matching halves eventually
  – And one right now
• Mallory’s only choice is to generate a new message before he knows the real message

Mallory’s Only Option
Why Is This A Problem For Mallory?

- Mallory must now spoof proper contents of Bob and Alice’s conversation
- Without knowing the real contents until later
- Bob and Alice are likely to notice problems quickly

Is This Generally Feasible?

- Not really
- Assumes Bob has a useful, unguessable message before Alice’s message arrives
- Not really the way the world works
- If Mallory can guess Bob’s message, he can play the standard man-in-the-middle game

Diffie/Hellman Key Exchange

- Securely exchange a key
  - Without previously sharing any secrets
- Alice and Bob agree on a large prime $n$ and a number $g$
  - $g$ should be primitive mod $n$
- $n$ and $g$ don’t need to be secrets

Exchanging a Key in Diffie/Hellman

- Alice and Bob want to set up a session key
  - How can they learn the key without anyone else knowing it?
- Protocol assumes authentication
- Alice chooses a large random integer $x$ and sends Bob $X = g^x \mod n$

Exchanging the Key, Con’t

- Bob chooses a random large integer $y$ and sends Alice $Y = g^y \mod n$
- Alice computes $k = Y^x \mod n$
- Bob computes $k' = X^y \mod n$
- $k$ and $k'$ are both equal to $g^{xy} \mod n$
- But nobody else can compute $k$ or $k'$

Why Can’t Others Get the Secret?

- What do they know?
  - $n$, $g$, $X$, and $Y$
  - Not $x$ or $y$
- Knowing $X$ and $y$ gets you $k$
- Knowing $Y$ and $x$ gets you $k’$
- Knowing $X$ and $Y$ gets you nothing
  - Unless you compute the discrete logarithm to obtain $x$ or $y$